

GRADING RUBRIC (for a full description see the pdf in Lessons):

ASSESSMENT	MAX. POINTS	YOUR SCORE
SYNTHESIS and THESIS	20	17
FOUNDATION and Evidence	20	18
APPLICATION/CRITICAL THINKING	20	19
ORGANIZATION AND FORMAT	20	20
WRITTEN COMMUNICATION	20	17
	100	92

Charles:

I applaud your industry in tackling a subject as vast as the UN: its bureaucracy, scope, and purposes are truly global and, when the theoretical models seeking to explain them are added in, the material becomes overwhelming. Nevertheless, you cover a number of key ideas well in a short paper, and focusing on security, health, and peacekeeping is certainly a defensible choice. These are the areas (along with budget) that have attracted the most scholarly attention and calls for reform. Your organization is well-structured and your Goldilocks approach to what to do with the UN--the bad, worse, and just right options--is well presented and covers the basics. That said, you need more on what precise reforms you'd like to see. For example, should the Security Council "Perm 5" be expanded, and if so, who gets added in? Also, the very design of the UN was political from the start--which is why the big powers got vetoes, which they didn't have in the League of Nations. As such, is to be expected that politics will derail attempts to make it a stronger, more cohesive bureaucracy? You have good sources though not all cites are fully paginated. Your structure is good but you tend to repeat yourself--a good edit could have cut many words, esp. at the opening. Nevertheless, you cover a good deal of ground and balance the areas of responsibility the UN manages well

Is the United Nations Still Needed?

Charles Titus, MPA

International Relations 502 – International Political Systems

Professor: Dr. James Sofka

11/14/2015

American Public University System

The United Nations has been in existence for many years. It has helped bring together nations around the world. However, in 2003 the United States did not include the United Nations when it decided to invade Iraq and wage war. The question can be asked if a country can easily bypass the United Nations, then is the United Nations even needed anymore. This paper will analyze if the United Nations is still needed and if so if it should be reformed in some way or if it should be done away with because it is outdated.

Purpose of the Research Project

The purpose of this research project is to see if the United Nations is still needed in this day and age and if so should there be reforms done to the organization. There have been discussions that the United Nations is no longer needed. The preliminary findings are that the United Nations is still needed and some reforms should be done within the organization. However, there is some work that shows that the United Nations needs to be abolished completely. The hypothesis of this project is that the United Nations does need to continue operating and changes do not need to be made to the organization.

The Issue at hand

The issue at hand that has spurred some questions about the United Nations and it needing to be reformed is involving the United States. In 2003 the United States did not include the United Nations when it decided to invade Iraq and wage war. The reason why this is an issue is because one of the purposes of the United Nations is peacekeeping and insuring that peace is being carried out within the world. If a state such as the United States can easily bypass the United Nations then what is the purpose of having the United Nations. However, it should be pointed out that the Iraq War that was carried out in 2003 is not a case of "pure unilateralism" (Thompson, 2012, p. 3). With that said the invasion that was carried out in Iraq did not have the permission of the United Nations Security Council (Thompson,

2012, p. 3). There were many governments around the world that did indeed express support of the war, the only countries that participated in combat during the war were the United Kingdom, Australia, and Poland (Thompson, 2012, p. 3). Since the United States did indeed bypass the United Nations in regards to waging war against Iraq, brings up the question as to whether the organization is still needed.

History of the United Nations

When looking to see if the United Nations is still needed one needs to get a clear understanding of the history of the United Nations. The United Nations is an international organization that is composed of 193 member states. The United Nations is an organization that helps with issues involving “peace and security, climate change, sustainable development, human rights, disarmament, terrorism, humanitarian and health emergencies, gender equality, governance, food production, and more” (United Nations, 2015, para. 2). The United Nations was created in 1945 when 50 countries met in San Francisco and signed the United Nations Charter (United Nations, 2014, para. 3). The exact date that the charter was signed by the 50 states was on “26 June 1945 by the representatives of the 50 countries” in attendance (United Nations, 2014, para. 4). In other words, the United Nations has been in existence for over seventy years. The thought process behind the United Nations was “during the Second World War, when representatives of 26 nations pledged their Governments to continue fighting together against the Axis Powers” (United Nations, 2014, para. 1).

Even though the United Nations was created in 1945, there was an organization that was in existence well before the United Nations creation that had a similar purpose. The organization was called the League of Nations. The League of Nations was an intergovernmental organization created in 1920 due to the Paris Peace Conference that brought an end to World War I (Henig, 2010, p. 1). The purpose of the League of Nations

was to maintain and ensure there was peace within the world. The League of Nations was created in order to keep wars from taking place by having collective security and also settling any disputes between countries through them negotiating and arbitration (Henig, 2010, p. 3). The League of Nations last meeting was in 1946 and the organization was officially dissolved in the year 1947 (Henig, 2010, p. 218 – 219). When looking at the League of Nations there are a few reasons why it did not succeed and last. One of the major reasons that it did not succeed was due to the fact that the United States never joined the League of Nations. The Senate of the United States held some reservations towards the League due to the fact that they felt it would take away some of the sovereign of the United States and the countries right of freedom of action (Henig, 2010). Another major blow or reason why the League of Nations did not succeed was when Germany and Japan left the league in 1933. Japan left the League of Nations after the League did not recognize Manchukuo and Germany left after the “German delegation walks out of Disarmament Conference” (Henig, 2010, p. 214). The League of Nations was a weak organization and did not have the support of all of the countries such as the United States. Without the support of the United States, it lead the way of other countries to easily leave the League of Nations without fear of any real sanctions being placed against them that would harm them in the long run.

When looking at the League of Nations it was a weak organization and did not have a lot of means to hold member states accountable, which is one of the main reasons why it did not succeed. With that said one can conclude that when the United Nations was created the League of Nations was looked at and was determined that a better organization could be created which could hold member states more accountable.

Purpose of the United Nations

By understanding the history of the United Nations and an organization that was before

the United Nations one can then look to see what the true purpose of the United Nations is. The United Nations is an organization whose purpose is to maintain peace and security within the world, create friendly relationship among nations, creating better living standards, ensuring that human rights are not being violated, and ensuring that progress is being made socially, along with many other things that the United Nations is involved in (United Nations, 2015, para. 2). Some of the most important things the United Nation deals with are peacekeeping, state formation, and global health. With that said this paper will look at these three areas and determine if the United Nations needs to be changed in any way, abolished.

The United Nations Being Successful

In order for the United Nations to be successful it has to have the support of the all of the member states that are a part of the organization. The United Nations is “dependent upon a steady commitment to supplying resources and the ability to properly assess and appropriately respond to specific realities within the context of a peacekeeping operation” (Pushkina & Maier, 2012, p. 324). If the United Nations does not have the support of the member organizations then it will not be successful or will not have the desired outcome when it gets involved in a peacekeeping matter (Pushkina & Maier, 2012, p. 339). In other words, when looking at the United Nations if it does not have the support of the member organizations one can conclude that it would become just like the League of Nations. The reason is because the League of Nations lost support of a few different member countries and as a result ended up losing credibility with the other member countries. There are a few different ways that a country can give support to the United Nations. One is for member countries to give money to the United Nations in order to make sure that it has the finances to run and operate around the world in order to achieve its mission. For example, the United States United Nations regular budget for the budget year 2012-2013 was \$5.15 billion

(Schaefer, 2012, para. 3). Without the support of the members of the United Nations then the United Nations would not be able to achieve the goals that it has in its mission statement.

Peacekeeping

By understanding the purpose of the United Nations and the history of the organization one can then start to look at how to analyze the organization. One of the major purposes of the United Nations is to ensure that peacekeeping is being kept throughout the world. When looking at the peacekeeping operations of the United Nations it is very important to look at the operations over a period of time. In the year 1998, the United Nations peacekeeping operations dealt with an average of three task one of which included “observing cease-fires.” (Christoff, 2010). However, in the year 2008, the United Nations peacekeeping operations had “nine more ambitious tasks, such as restoring government institutions” (Christoff, 2010). Another thing that needs to be pointed out is that in the year 2008, the United Nations also was more involved in “some of the world's most unstable countries” (Christoff, 2010). In other words, in a time span of 10 years what the United Nations does in regards to its peacekeeping mission went from three basic task to nine task that took much more time and efforts of the United Nations. The United Nations has been involved in 71 peacekeeping operations since the year 1948 and is currently involved in 16 peacekeeping operations at this time (United Nations Peacekeeping Operations, 2015, p. 1). When the United Nations is involved in a peacekeeping operation in can be a number of different things that the United Nations is doing to keep the peace. The United Nations can have troops, police, military observers, and even civilian personnel based in a state to help keep the mission of peace in the area that the organization is involved in. An example of a peacekeeping mission that is considered a success involves East Timor. The United Nations was able to keep peace when the people in East Timor voted to form their own nation (Harmer & Frith, 2009). As a result of

being able to keep the peace in East Timor it is considered a success for the United Nations in regards to its peacekeeping mission of the organization. When looking at the peacekeeping missions of the United Nations it is very important to also look at Cyprus as well. The peacekeeping force that is based in Cyprus is actually the oldest force that is still in operation for the United Nations (Dorn, 2014, 184). The mission in Cyprus by the United Nations is another success story for the organization because it has been able to maintain the peace in this part of the world. One can conclude that if the United Nations was not involved in Cyprus then it would lead to an armed conflict taking place in this area.

It is very important to also note that even though the United Nations has been successful in many situations in regards to peacekeeping, there has been times when the United Nations was not successful. In 1994, there was a genocide that was carried out in Rwanda that resulted in over 800,000 people being killed (Berdal, 2005, p. 115). The United Nations could have stepped in and kept the genocide from taking place. However, the United Nations did not do anything in this case and as a result a lot of people were killed. Had the United Nations stepped in and addressed the issues that were taking place then a lot of innocent people would not have been killed in Rwanda.

State Formation

When analyzing the United Nations it is very important to look at its role in State Formation. One area that the United Nations gets involved in that goes hand in hand with peacekeeping is state formation. State Formation is when there is a portion of a country or area in the world that wants to create their own country. When looking at this area one can look at the United Nations involvement in South Sudan, East Timor, and other countries that it got involved in to create a new state. The United Nations was able to help form the country of East Timor by getting involved and monitoring the situation in this country (Harmer & Frith,

2009). In East Timor the people in this country actually voted for their independence and the United Nations helped them get their independence from Indonesia. Had the United Nations not gotten involved in East Timor then it is very possible that the country would not have been able to vote for their independence and ultimately gain their independence. It is also very possible that had the United Nations not got involved then the conflict that was taking place in this country would have continued to take place. In other words, the United Nations getting involved in East Timor helped usher in the creation of the country East Timor. Another state the United Nations has helped form is South Sudan. The United Nations helped South Sudan in becoming a new nation in 2011 and is helping with trying to maintain peace in this country as a result (Harengel & Gbadamosi, 2014, p. 35).

Global Health

Another area that the United Nations needs to be looked at is in the area of global health. One of the missions of the United Nations is to address global health issues. One way to analyze this area is by looking at the United Nations World Health Organization arm of the organization. This is the part of the United Nations that tries to address global health issues. It needs to be noted that in 2007 the World Health Organization was given the authority to declare global health emergencies (Renwick & Johnson, 2014, para. 12). When looking at the World Health Organization one should look at the response that was given by the organization towards Ebola. Renwick & Johnson (2014) pointed out that the response that was given by the World Health Organization has come into question due to the remarks by a director of the organization. The director stated the organization was “a technical agency that provides advice and support and that governments in West Africa had the primary responsibility to care for victims of the disease” (para. 11). This is kind of misleading when you have an organization that has the authority to declare major health issues but the

organization itself looks at itself as only being a technical agency. The reason is because one would think that the organization that has the power to declare health emergencies would have more power. With that said, the World Health Organization has helped with many different issues around the world. One example that can be given is the reduction in Aids cases over the years.

What Recourse Does United Nations Have

It is important to look at the recourse that the United Nations has in the event that it wants to get a country to act in a certain way. The recourse that the United Nations has is by imposing sanctions against a government if it feels that it is not acting in a manner that the organization agrees with. Sanctions are “economic or diplomatic actions taken by a state or alliance of states against another state or individuals as coercive measures usually to endorse a violated law or treaty” (Charron, 2009, p. 26). When the United Nations Security Council carries out sanctions it is done as a tool in order to change the behavior of government that is considered a peace breaker (Charron, 2009, p. 26). In other words, the sanctions are meant as a way to try and restore peace in the area that the sanctions have been imposed.

Looking at the Options

After one has an understanding of a few different aspects that the United Nations deals with then one can look to see if the organization needs to be reformed, kept the same, or abolished completely. It is very important to look at the three areas before a conclusion can be made in regards to which option is the best one for the United Nations.

Abolishing the United Nations

There are people that have felt the United Nations needs to be done away with completely. When looking at the reasons why some people feel that the United Nations

needs to be abolished is for many different reasons. Greenfield (2011) pointed out that the United Nations hurts America because it obstructs us from defending ourselves within the free world (location 67). Thus meaning that the reason why the United Nations needs to be done away with is due to the claim that the organization hurts the United States. Another reason why some people feel that the United Nations needs to be abolished is because the “UN distorts women's rights to promote violence against women” (Greenfield, 2011, location 245). Then another issue that has been brought forth is that the United Nations needs to be abolished because the organization is not able to achieve independence or freedom from very powerful states such as the United States (Allen & Yuen, 2014, p. 630).

Not changing the United Nations in any Way.

Another option that is being presented is that the United Nations is not in changed in any way, shape or form. The reason is because people feel that the United Nations is a very important agency and has a “remarkable record of expertise and achievement” on many different issues that it has dealt with (Tharoor, 2003, p. 78). There are scholars that feel that by changing the United Nations in any way could possibly hurt or even cause the United Nations not to be as successful as it has been in the past. It can be pointed out that the things that the United Nations carries out are actions that one country alone cannot address (Tharoor, 2003, p. 78). It should also be pointed out that when the United Nations currently passes a resolution it is seen as being in the best interest of humanity (Tharoor, 2003, p. 68). The fear is that by changing the United Nations in any way could cause people to not pay attention to the resolutions that have would be passed by the changed and reformed United Nations.

Reforming the United Nations

The third option that can could take place in regards to the United Nations is reforming

the organization. There have been people that have come out and said that the parts of the United Nations needs to be reformed, such as the Security Council in order to make the organization stronger. There have been people that have come out to say that the Security Council needs to be reformed because it does not reflect the true military and economic power that can be seen around the world (Taylor & Curtis, 2008, p. 317). The advantages to reforming the United Nations is that it would mean that any issues that is facing the organization could possibly be resolved. Plus it would mean that having an entity that has 193 members would not go away.

Which View Is Best

When looking at the three possibilities that can be carried out towards the United Nations one needs to look to see which one would make the most sense. Abolishing the United Nations would not be in the best interest of the world as a whole. The reason is because the United Nations has helped achieve peace, create new states, and helped with food issues and many other things. By abolishing an organization such as the United Nations could actually hurt the world as a whole. Also, the arguments that the United Nations should be abolished based upon the claims that it hurts the United States is very poor. The reason is because the United States has partnered with the United Nations many times since it has been created to get things done around the world (Seaman, 2014). One could argue that doing away with the United Nations could actually cause harm to the United States and other countries around the world. The reason is because if there is an issue that has taken place between two countries, a country can turn to the United Nations for support. If this is taken away then it would cause a lot of harm to within international relations and could cause larger and more powerful states to take advantage of smaller states. In other words, the United Nations is an organization that can be used to keep larger states like the United States and

Russia in check. Another issue with abolishing the United Nations is that if this was to take place then it would mean that there would not be an organization in place that has 193 member states working together to achieve goals that are good for the entire country.

The other possibility that has been discussed is not reforming the United Nations in any way. Although this is a good point of view it needs to be pointed out that if the United Nations does not change in any way then it is very possible that it could go the same way that the League of Nations went in 1945. The League of Nations was closed and did not do much to change the way that the organization operated. Thus meaning that it would not make much sense to keep the United Nations operating the same way. In other words, keeping the United Nations as it currently is does not make sense because it could end up losing support of member states and thus meaning that the United Nations could go the way of the League of Nations.

The other area that has been proposed is that the United Nations should be reformed to make it a much better organization. The United Nations itself has called for the organization to be reformed in a manner that would allow it to be better at peacekeeping (Browne, 2011, p. 27). The United Nations came out and proposed that it would be better if the Peacekeeping department within the United Nations were split into two departments with one being the "Department of Peace Operations and the Department of Field Support" (Browne, 2011, p. 27). This just goes to show you that the United Nations itself is pointing out that it needs to be reformed in order to make it better to operate a part of the organization. If an organization comes out and says that it feels that it would be in the best interest of reforming or changing a part of the organization then it should show that this is the proper course of action. By reforming the organization it would mean that there would still be an organization that brings together so many different governments to discuss ways to keep the

world safe and to keep peace.

By looking at the three options it is clear to see that reforming the United Nations is the best option and the one that makes the most sense. The reason is because the United Nation itself has called for it to be reformed in many different ways over the years. The ways that the United Nations could be reformed is by changing the Security Council. Currently the Security Council is composed of five permanent members which are China, France, Russia, the Great Britain and the United States. Then the Security Council has ten members that are elected by the General Assembly every two years (Taylor & Curtis, 2008, p. 315). The Security Council should be reformed in a way that better reflects the distribution of the military and economic power within the world. Another area that the United Nations should be reformed is by putting measures into place that would allow the United Nations to indeed reform itself in areas that would make it better for the organization. For example, the United Nations has proposed splitting up the peacekeeping operation into two departments. By having things in place that keep the United Nations from becoming a better organization makes no sense. The reason is because the United Nations does a lot of good for the world. If changing the organization would mean that it would make the organization better than it should be done. It is also very important that the United Nations look at reforming the World Health Organization. This part of the United Nations needs to be looked at and given more power when it involves health issues that could impact the entire world. If it does not then it could mean that there will be more outbreaks of deadly infections and diseases.

Another area that needs to be looked at and reformed is the way that sanctions are carried out by the United Nations. Currently sanctions that are issued by the United Nations are done by the Security Council. The Security Council has five countries that hold permanent memberships and have the right to veto any sanctions that it does not agree with.

If a member of the Security Council vetoes the proposed sanctions then it means that the sanctions will not be put into place. With that said it would be nearly impossible for the United Nations to impose sanctions on China, France, Russia, Great Britain or the United States due to the veto power that these countries hold. As a result if any of these five countries carry out an action that the majority of the United Nations does not agree with then it could just veto any possible sanctions that are proposed. Thus meaning that these countries could hypothetically speaking, get away with doing things such as going to War or invading another country. In the past fifteen years two countries that hold a veto power have done just that. The United States invaded Iraq and went to war, and then Russia and their invasion of Ukraine.

Reforming the United Nations is the best decision possible because the United Nations is made up of 193 member states. Having an organization that has most of the countries in the world in it is very important to continue to have. The reason is that it allows countries to come together and try to solve problems that many of the countries are facing. One can conclude that when countries work together there is a higher chance of success in addressing the issue at hand. If the United Nations was not be abolished then the world would lose this organization.

If the reforms are carried out it would indeed make the United Nations a much better organization. It would also keep countries such as the United States and Russia from being able to take advantage of their position on the Security Council of the United Nations. Thus meaning that reforms of the United Nations need to take place in order to make the United Nations a much stronger organization.

Limitations of this research.

When looking at the United Nations there are many different things that the organization is

involved with. One of the limitations that can be seen in this paper is that the United Nations was only looked at in regards to peacekeeping, state formation, and global health. The United Nations also deals with climate change, sustainable development, human rights, food production and much more. In this research project there was not much information given or looked at that involved how the United Nations is involved in this area. Future research should be done in regards to these areas mentioned to gauge if changes should be made to the United Nations and how it operates in regards to these areas. The reason why this information was not looked at was due to the fact that there was not enough time to properly analyze this information and to research it and make recommendations towards it.

Conclusion

The United Nations is an organization that has been in operation since the mid 1940's. It has done a lot of good for the world. The question has come up if the United Nations needs to still be in existence if it can be bypassed by countries that want to carry out an action. By looking at all of the information presented one can clearly see that the United Nations is a great organization for the world and it does not need to be done away with. However, the United Nations should indeed be reformed in a few different areas in order to make it a much better organization.

References

- Allen, S. H., & Yuen, A. T. (2014). The Politics of Peacekeeping: UN Security Council Oversight Across Peacekeeping Missions. *International Studies Quarterly*, 58(3), 621-632. doi:10.1111/isqu.12086
- Berdal, M. (2005). The United Nations, Peacebuilding, and the Genocide in Rwanda. *Global Governance*, 11(1), 115-130. Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com/docview/213733852?accountid=8289>
- Browne, Marjorie. (2010). United Nations Peacekeeping: Issues for Congress. In E.R. Isely (Ed), *Global political studies: United nations peacekeeping in the 21st century* Nova Science Publishers, Inc.
- Charron, A. E. (2009). *United Nations Sanctions in Four Conflict Types* (Order No. NR52309). Available from ProQuest Central. (305137569). Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com/docview/305137569?accountid=8289>
- Christoff, Joseph. (2010). United Nations Peacekeeping: Challenges Obtaining Needed Resources Could Limit Further Large Deployments and Should be Addressed in U.S. Reports to Congress. In E.R. Isely (Ed), *Global political studies: United nations peacekeeping in the 21st century* Nova Science Publishers, Inc.
- Dorn, A. W. (2014). Electronic Eyes on the Green Line: Surveillance by the United Nations Peacekeeping Force in Cyprus. *Intelligence and National Security*, 29(2), 184-207. doi:10.1080/02684527.2013.834216
- Greenfield, Daniel. (2011). 10 Reasons to Abolish the UN. [Kindle Edition]. Sherman Oaks, CA: The David Horowitz Freedom Center.
- Harengel, P., & Gbadamosi, A. (2014). 'Launching' a New Nation: The Unfolding Brand of South Sudan. *Place Branding and Public Diplomacy*, 10(1), 35. doi:10.1057/pb.2013.12
- Harmer, A., & Frith, R. (2009). "Walking Together" Toward Independence? A Civil Society Perspective on the United Nations Administration in East Timor, 1999–2002. *Global Governance*, 15(2), 239-258.
- Henig, R. (2010). *The league of nations : The makers of the modern world*. New York: Haus Publishing.
- Pushkina, D., & Maier, P. (2012). United Nations Peacekeeping in Timor-Leste. *Civil Wars*, 14(3), 324. doi:10.1080/13698249.2012.706949
- Renwick, Danielle, & Johnson, Toni. (2014). The World Health Organization. *Council on Foreign Relations*. Retrieved November 12, 2015 from <http://www.cfr.org/public-health->

threats-and-pandemics/world-health-organization-/p20003

SAVIR, U. (2012). A New United Nations is Needed. *Jerusalem Post*

Schaefer, Brett. (2012). U.S. Needs Financial Leverage to Hold Line on U.N. Budget. *The Heritage Foundation*. Retrieved November 10, 2015 from <http://www.heritage.org/research/reports/2012/12/united-nations-budget-constraint-and-the-us-financial-leverage>

Seaman, K. (2014). *UN-tied Nations: The United Nations, Peacekeeping and Global Governance* (Newition ed.). GB: Ashgate Publishing Ltd.

Taylor, P & Curtis, D. (2008). The United Nations. In Baylis & Smith (Ed). *The Globalization of World Politics* 4th Ed. (pp. 312-329). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Tharoor, Shashi. (2003). Why America Still Needs the United Nations. *Foreign Affairs*, 82(5) retrieved October 16, 2015

Thompson, Alexander. (2011). Why Did Bush Bypass the UN in 2003? Unilateralism, Multilateralism and Presidential Leadership. *White House Studies*, 11(3). ISSN: 1535-4738. Retrieved November 10, 2015 from http://politicalscience.osu.edu/faculty/athompson/Thompson_WhiteHouseStudies_Proofs.pdf

United Nations. (2014). History of The United Nations. Retrieved November 8, 2015 from <http://www.un.org/en/sections/history/history-united-nations/index.html>

United Nations. (2015). Overview. Retrieved October 15, 2015 from <http://www.un.org/en/sections/about-un/overview/index.html>

United Nations Peacekeeping Operations. (2015). Fact Sheet. Retrieved November 10, 2015